

Teri Rennia, City Council President Angela Holmes, City Clerk

#### **MINUTES**

City Council Business Meeting
Council Chambers, 38 Hawley Street, Binghamton, N.Y.
Wednesday June 19, 2013

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

Called to order by Council President Rennia at 6:30pm.

#### **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Council President Rennia led the Pledge of Allegiance.

#### **ROLL CALL**

Present: Jerry Motsavage, Joseph Mihalko, Teri Rennia, Lea Webb, Chris Papastrat, John Matzo, Bill Berg

Absent: None

Also in attendance: Kenneth J. Frank, Corporation Counsel; Angela Holmes, City Clerk

#### **REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Motion to approve the minutes from the City Council Business Meeting held on June 5, 2013. Moved by Motsavage, seconded by Matzo.

Voice vote, none opposed.

Councilman Motsavage noted that Binghamton City Council's Municipal and Public Affairs Committee will meet on Monday July 1, 2013 at 5:00pm to discuss the City of Binghamton's noise ordinance. This meeting will be held in the City Council Work Room, located through the City Clerk's Office on the first floor of City Hall, 38 Hawley Street, Binghamton, NY.

Councilman Berg noted that the City Council Business Meetings in July will be held on Tuesday July 2, 2013 and Wednesday July 17, 2013. Both meetings will be held in the City Council Chambers, 38 Hawley Street, Binghamton, NY.

#### **RECOGNITIONS AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Councilwoman Webb read "A Proclamation in recognition of Juneteenth in the City of Binghamton" into the record.

#### **PUBLIC HEARING**

#### Introductory Ordinance 13-46. Considered in Planning & Community Development, Chair: Webb

An Ordinance authorizing various amendments to Sections 265 and 410 of the Binghamton City Code, regarding Community Food Systems

Note: Notice of public hearing was published in the Press & Sun Bulletin on June 14, 2013.

In Favor: Sean Cummings, Lauren Tonti, Jimmy Borsios, Mark Bowers, Amy Shapiro, Dick Andrus, Shamas Harper, Ken Holmes, Rebecca Heller-Steinberg, Dan Livingston, Scott Lauffer, Sean Ryer, Isaac Julius Silberman-Gorm, Cecily O'Neil, Joshua DeMarree, Cole Harrington, Jack Sheehan, Johan Jelsma, Christopher Frey, Earl Westerlund<sup>1</sup>, Fiske Hanson<sup>2</sup> Opposed: Karl Bernhardsen, Petition<sup>3</sup>

Teri Rennia, City Council President Angela Holmes, City Clerk

<sup>1</sup>Note: Earl Westerlund submitted the following email to Council President Rennia June 19, 2013. The original letter is attached to these minutes.

Ms. Rennia,

I have read and support the proposed changes to zoning law to allow limited community agriculture in the City. I think that the proposed changes strike the proper balance between allowing small agriculture, and protecting the rights of nearby residents. I do not intend to keep chickens or rabbits, but have no problem if my neighbors choose to.

I will not be able to attend this evening's public hearing, so I wanted to express my support via email.

Please contact me with any questions. Thanks for your time.

Sincerely, Earl Westerlund

<sup>2</sup>Note: Fiske Hanson submitted the following email to the City Clerk's Office on June 19, 2013. The original letter is attached to these minutes.

To Councilman Chris Papastrat and City Clerk Angela B. Holmes From Fiske Hanson 16 Hotchkiss St., Binghamton For the June 19 2013 Public Hearing Record

I do believe the Proposed Community Food System Zoning Amendment needs to be approved for a number of reasons: addresses and defines areas such as Farmers markets and Market Gardens, for which there is no provision at all and it allows for six chickens to be compatible with the State minimum purchase, and defines acceptable standards for practices such as composting and animal, poultry shelter and care.

It is beneficial to have definitions and standards, in particular, for those areas that are of concern to Binghamton residents and neighbors because the concerns do need to be addressed.

Community gardens are good examples to show how communication in a neighborhood improves cooperation and engagement.

If Council members haven't visited the VINES gardens ask for a tour. It's an eye opener.

Thank you, Fiske Hanson

 $^3$ Note: A petition signed by 132 individuals was submitted to the City Clerk's Office on June 19, 2013. The original petition is attached to these minutes.

We the undersigned residents of the City of Binghamton are urging City Council to vote no on the pending legislation dealing with urban agricultural farming. Our reasons for requesting a no vote are as follows:



Teri Rennia, City Council President Angela Holmes, City Clerk

\_\_\_\_\_

- 1. We wish to preserve our neighborhoods especially the R-1 and R-2 residential districts.
- 2. Vacant properties should be sold and redeveloped into properties that will return to the tax rolls of the City.
- 3. Farm animals, livestock, etc. do not belong in residential neighborhoods.
- 4. The City of Binghamton Code Dept. cannot keep up with the present case load, so why add more???
- 5. Composting creates and draws rodents and other undesirables that make their way onto neighboring properties.
- 6. Too many people have allergic reactions to bee stings and some don't realize their allergic unto it is too late.
- 7. Who will care for the abandoned animals when to owners/renters decide to up and leave the area?
- 8. Who is to maintain the community garden when the owners/operators move on??
- 9. Community gardens already exist (10 or more) and with the downtown farmers markets Tuesdays thru the weekend and the upcoming county run gardens, isn't the area saturated with this type of garden products already?

In closing, we support backyard gardening by individual homeowners, not the bulk type that this legislation is proposing. The 132 number of signatures should tell our elected officials that the constituency has concerns with the legislation and ask that it not be supported at this time.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT/COMMUNICATIONS**

Lawrence Pierce, Christina Pierce, Douglas Walter Drazen, Jack Sheehan

#### **SECOND READING LEGISLATION**

#### Introductory Resolution 13-52. Considered in Finance, Chair: Webb

A Resolution amending Permanent Resolution 12-81, regarding funds from the Communality Capital Assistance Program for the Design Your Own Park Initiative

Note: This legislation was first considered at the Business Meeting held on June 5, 2013.

Motion to approve legislation. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.

#### Motion carried. Legislation adopted as Permanent Resolution 13-57. (Vote 7-0)

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

#### **FIRST READING LEGISLATION**

#### Introductory Ordinance 13-44. Considered in Planning & Community Development, Chair: Webb

An Ordinance authorizing the abandonment of 126 Eldredge Street (a portion of Liberty Street) as a public street Note: Notice of public hearing was published in the Press & Sun Bulletin on May 31, 2013. A public hearing occurred at the Business Meeting held on June 5, 2013.

Motion to approve legislation. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.

#### Motion carried. Legislation adopted. (Vote 7-0)

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

#### Introductory Ordinance 13-45. Considered in Finance, Chair: Webb

An Ordinance authorizing the temporary use of expense funds to purchase police vehicles pending completion of vehicle capital lease obligations

Motion to approve legislation. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion carried. Legislation adopted as Permanent Ordinance 13-42. (Vote 7-0)



Teri Rennia, City Council President Angela Holmes, City Clerk

\_\_\_\_\_

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

**Recall.** Motion to recall Introductory Ordinance 13-33 in order to declare the City of Binghamton as lead agency, to approve the legislation as an unlisted action, and to adopt the negative declaration in accordance with the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act.

Moved by Motsavage, seconded by Matzo.

Voice vote, none opposed.

#### Introductory Ordinance 13-44. Considered in Planning & Community Development, Chair: Webb

An Ordinance authorizing the abandonment of 126 Eldredge Street (a portion of Liberty Street) as a public street Note: Notice of public hearing was published in the Press & Sun Bulletin on May 31, 2013. A public hearing occurred at the Business Meeting held on June 5, 2013.

- 1. Motion to reintroduce Introductory Ordinance 13-44. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.
- Motion to declare City Council as lead agency. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.
   Voice vote, none opposed.
- 3. Motion to approve Introductory Ordinance 13-44 as an unlisted action. Moved by Webb, seconded by Berg.

Voice vote, none opposed.

4. Motion to approve a State Environmental Quality Review (SEQR) Negative Declaration Determination of Non-Significance for the abandonment and sale of a portion of Liberty Street (a/k/s 126 Eldredge).

Motion to adopt a negative declaration.

Moved by Webb, seconded by Matzo.

Voice vote, none opposed.

5. Motion to approve legislation.

Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion carried. Motion carried. Legislation adopted as Permanent Ordinance 13-43. (Vote 7-0)

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

#### Introductory Resolution 13-58. Considered in Finance, Chair: Webb

A Resolution authorizing the Mayor to enter into Supplemental Agreement No. 2 with New York State Department of Transportation for Front Street Reconstruction at Clinton Street, PIN 99752.74

Motion to approve legislation. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion carried. Legislation adopted as Permanent Resolution 13-58. (Vote 7-0)

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None



Teri Rennia, City Council President Angela Holmes, City Clerk

\_\_\_\_\_

#### Introductory Resolution 13-59. Considered in Finance, Chair: Webb

A Resolution authorizing the City to enter into an agreement with NYS Division of Criminal Justice Services for Operation Impact X (2013-2014)

Motion to approve legislation. Moved by Webb, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion carried. Legislation adopted as Permanent Resolution 13-59. (Vote 7-0)

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

#### **COMMUNICATIONS FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS**

Berg, Motsavage, Mihalko, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Rennia

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

Motion to adjourn at 8:29pm. Moved by Webb, seconded by Matzo. **Voice vote, none opposed.** 

#### Holmes, Angela

From: Teri Rennia [TRennia@enviren.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 19, 2013 3:56 PM

To: Holmes, Angela

Subject: FW: Proposed Community Food System Zoning Proposal

#### Hi Angela,

I guess you can add this to the pile that I just know you have ;)

From: Earl Westerlund [mailto:earble@gmail.com]

**Sent:** Wednesday, June 19, 2013 3:48 PM **To:** district3@cityofbinghamton.com

Subject: Proposed Community Food System Zoning Proposal

Ms. Rennia --

I have read and support the proposed changes to zoning law to allow limited community agriculture in the City. I think that the propsed changes strike the proper balance between allowing small agriculture, and protecting the rights of nearby residents. I do not intend to keep chickens or rabbits, but have no problem if my neighbors choose to.

I will not be able to attend this evening's public hearing, so I wanted to express my support via email.

Please contact me with any questions. Thanks for your time.

Sincerely, Earl Westerlund 28 Lathrop Avenue 217-4110

#### Holmes, Angela

From: Fiske Hanson [fiskehanson@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 19, 2013 6:25 PM
To: Chris Papastrat: Holmes, Angela

**Subject:** Community Food System Zoning Amendment Proposal

To Councilman Chris Papastrat and City Clerk Angela B. Holmes From Fiske Hanson 16 Hotchkiss St., Binghamton For the June 19 2013 Public Hearing Record

I do believe the Proposed Community Food System Zoning Amendment needs to be approved for a number of reasons: addresses and defines areas such as Farmers markets and Market Gardens, for which there is no provision at all and it allows for six chickens to be compatible with the State minimum purchase, and defines acceptable standards for practices such as composting and animal, poultry shelter and care.

It is beneficial to have definitions and standards, in particular, for those areas that are of concern to Binghamton residents and neighbors because the concerns do need to be addressed.

Community gardens are good examples to show how communication in a neighborhood improves cooperation and engagement.

If Council members haven't visited the VINES gardens ask for a tour. It's an eye opener. Thank you, Fiske Hanson

WE THE UNDERSIGNED RESIDENTS OF THE CITY OF BIGHAMTON ARE URGING CITY COUNCIL TO VOTE NO ON THE PENDING LEGISLATION DEALING WITH URBAN AGRICULTURAL FARMING. OUR REASONS FOR REQUESTING A NO VOTE ARE AS FOLLOWS:

- 1. WE WISH TO PRESERVE OUR NEGHBORHOODS ESPECIALLY THE R-1 AND R 2 RESIDENTIAL DISTRICTS.
- 2. VACANT PROPERTIES SHOULD BE SOLD AND RE-DEVELOPED INTO PROPERTIES THAT WILL RETURN TO THE TAX ROLES OF THE CITY
- 3. FARM ANIMALS, LIVESTOCK, ETC. DO NOT BELONG IN RESIDENTIAL NEIGHBORHOODS.
- 4. THE CITY OF BINGHAMTON CODE DEPT. CANNOT KEEP UP WITH THE PRESENT CASE LOAD, SO WHY ADD MORE??
- 5. COMPOSTING CREATES AND DRAWS RODENTS AND OTHER UNDESIRABLES THAT MAKE THEIR WAY ONTO NEIGHBORING PROPERTY.
- 6. TOO MANY PEOPLE HAVE ALLERGIC REACTIONS TO BEE STINGS AND SOME DON'T REALIZE THEIR ALLERGIC UNTO IT IS TOO LATE.
- 7. WHO WILL CARE FOR THE ABANDONED ANIMALS WHEN TO OWNERS/RENTERS DECIDE TO UP AND LEAVE THE AREA?
- 8. WHO IS TO MAINTAIN THE COMMUNITY GARDEN WHEN THE OWNERS/OPERATORS MOVE ON??
- 9. COMMUNITY GARDENS ALREADY EXIST (10 OR MORE) AND WITH THE DOWNTOWN FARMERS MARKETS TUESDAYS THRU THE WEEKEND AND THE UPCOMING COUNTY RUN GARDENS, ISN'T THE AREA SATURATED WITH THIS TYPE OF GARDEN PRODUCTS ALREADY?

IN CLOSING, WE SUPPORT BACKYARD GARDENING BY INDIVIDUAL HOMEOWNERS, NOT THE BULK TYPE THAT THIS LEGISLATION IS PROPOSING.. THE 32-NUMBER OF SIGNATURES SHOULD TELL OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS THAT THE CONSTITUENCY HAS CONCERNS WITH THE LEGISLATION AND ASK THAT IT NOT BE SUPPORTED AT THIS TIME.

#### ADDKE22

ADDKESS
1 Jony Massas 42 Dickinson of
2 De change assay 42 Dickinson St
3 BRusso 19 BW WERE RO
4 OKCh BUTBINGS
5 Level & Boll & GABINTAR. Bink
6 Michele Kennedy Toull 3400 My 13961
7 Ara Avena Janustreet Bung Ny 18903
O VI O Jan VI MA CO
9 Chillipsie Sichepins + Binghein ton U4, 13805
Il offen of the same of a Branch to
12 Robert M. Microst 24 LENNOX DR. Bloggy
13 Com 7 8 - 5 Letwood Pl. BINGHAMJON NY 13903
14 May Bouton The Kemdan De Shipman M 13/03
15 Jones To Kendall Ave Bing.
16 Delhuis hickan 14 break Ave, Bore
17 Potrice Melesson 149 Brand Ave Bing. NY 13905
18 Julian 73 Squall live 13903
19 tellethast 2 Manary & t. Bingling 13508
20 Anthy Story 70 Albrich 188 Brief 3965
21 Della Buchenar 1 Phillips 12903
22 Johnahill on kii in the Color of Bire 13804
23 Agras 16 Port 17 17 17 18 19 13 19 13
24 Strong M Mate 100 100 100 21 18/16 13705
25 Julklande 26 Marily die Burg 18909
Lo Charlette Bulkney W 26 G The ray acce Star 13909
025 Cha.
28 Victor Parkstat (75 Leny & + Birghanton NY 1390)
30 33 Revege ST Bing WY. 13203

# **ADDRESS** ZIKMONT.

p	the statement states state to the thing the to
1 FAREN BINEIT 2 KAREN BINEIT 3 Delorgs Boidman 4 Clear Way 5 Michael Drag 6 W. Franzle 7 Suzanno Michael 8	117 RepinsonSt Co- 326 FERNMAREDR 13905 15 HOWARD FOR BING. 28 Pakensus St. 13 15 Howard And Bing 177 Robinson ST BING 355 Robinson ST
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	

ARRESTANTO

44	ty all all all all all all all all all al		
1	Marjarie Segni	Rubin The	Binchenter
2.	July Robert 7	A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR	Add 1 1 7
3	JEHRY CAVANACIL	7 GRANAVIEW 1	The state of the s
4	Robert Zemannit		tu Bughpion h
5	1/2/5/	157/ John Mich De.	Dughanter 17
6		and the second s	
7		ырыр өлө жана оны бүйт барай кашшарынга өнө <b>дө 4 с</b> өө өнө кашараа өштөр өнө өнө банын арамында арарында өнө өшөөүө Э	The Committee of the Co
8		and are confirmed from the law and with the site and site and site of the second confirmation of the s	Hillips on common program of the common prog
9		форматия в строи подлетия выполнений быль ней воздологу и метрементору досторого досторого форматического строи у продуствення по подагого в подаго	BPGS-Agrammanannan-gramman-Agram Agramman-Agramm
10_			PMMAB processifal District College Col
11_		ekstepent grande ammensen pop og gelgetanden det granden støpten flere en flere flere flere kritiske til som protesje en grand protesje en flere større en større en grand protesje en flere større en større en grande	nik kajak kalansassasian kanaman kanam
12_			And state of the s
13_			оринального принального менен на предметринального предметринального предметринального предметринального предм При принального предметринального пре
14_			
15_			The hand the second
16_		needs on a some changes have placed a some free quality on a property changes of the placed on the p	
17_		ingering disabunah nigana yang asi igi kacinah nigan prosipisa san tarban suprapa angaranja pondasang palahilim prosipisa nanggi pan manang	and drove control and a processing and a group may
18_		unquintere esque for minimum non continue and many foreign in the continue and the continue	popularininės (pilo indiperiorininės politikas para para
19_ 20			normal proposation and the contract of the con
20_		.  ***Office of Amphoresis (2000) in Space does to make one of property of the Control of the Amphoresis (2000) in Control of the Amphores	Model-Synn-S-EulepenSynysisterypogs
22		атунку үш кайдардын Ароло Аронун менен жана ашарын ашарын ашарын ашарын ашарын ашарын ашарын ашарын ашарын аша С	Annach Common reproductive grant approach productive and productiv
23			менамеристингриманф Ремпулікороря
24		төрө менгин такжатын дамын үчөөрүн үчөөрүн жайман оситарган шармын төрөрүнүн кентексеренде арыстын ар	formation of the international constitutions.
25		Berger Andrews Company of the security of the	**************************************
26		and an increase of the state of	Newsonia Constitutes en
27		темприя установання мето мето постановання по до странции заправную учествующей постанований постанований пост Постанования постанования постанования по до странции заправную учествующей постанования постанования постанова	eq Heriopherent Sarting Australian group from beauty course
28			5000 for his household the section of the section o
29			wyda Scott III. Clyfefeidd Gwyllianau gyfaefeidd gwy
30		an engles of the section of the sect	mmaggarmagin deuts timelikum mendeling mendeling kelalang

	1 Domerice Lower 23 Horsatel Hell RD Benghanter My 13561
	2 Patrick 1 smaniaco 24 Bed ford 16 Bing 13903
	3 MARY LOUREGULSKI 23 HOLDARY AVE BING 13904
	4 Margrey Mc Malion 54 Howard Ove Bing 13904
	5 Chiefel & Many 37M, 1/5t. Bone 13903
	6 Interior Seenon 84 Mason Que Birla 13904
	7 Persona Dalles 69 Cleveland aux Bing: 13905
	8 horan Smarth 28 moeller St.
	9 Joyce Dekiti 13 Maria Marior 13903
	10 Dry gRate 5 Hawih owner Rd., Bungsanton 13903
	11 Part Markon 34 Em Ma St Burdhamber 13905
	12 Steve Majkh 34 Emma St. Bitishgenton 13905
	13 Nicholas Majka 34 Emma St. Binghamton 13905
	14 Kaleont Kelly do Howard As Burg 13904
,	15 Chande fillers 9 Howard Rie Bing 15904
	16 Acoust Flyton 3 Howard Ave Bing 13904
	17 Kaka F ( amount on G Haward Au Bing 13904
	18 Lingstoth onnet 6 Howard Jan Bings 1390 4
	19 Jelapes Council D House file 101119
	20 117101019 9 117W111CC
	21 Rosensagie Rusin 19 Howard Ave Bing 13904
•	22 Melad Jan 14 Howard AVE Blyz 13904
	23 years fooded 16 form All 6,00,13907
	- 25 THE 1 - 2604
•	25 /2 food Jestin 15 from Ave Binghanter 13904
	26 Janks Clarke 92 Howard av. Binghanter, 13904 27 Patricia Boorom 30 Monne St Byrghanter, 1390×
	28 Draw 10 worden 34 george St. Broghamber, 13904
	29 Janen More 10 Louisest Ringhenton NY 13904
	30 Stochanu Blausina 53 Myray St. Bing. 13905
	31. Maneter after 306 Robinson St. Bing 13904

# **ADDRESS**

7 Tola Bring & Wallet End Clor Sring	•
7 John Kush 5 West and Ow. Duly 8	
9	-
10	-
11	_
12	***
13	
14	
15	) printer
16	P+64
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	Address.
24 25	
26	periors.
2 <sup>r</sup> <sub>2</sub>	
28	
29	
30	